

Contents

List of Figures	xiii
List of Abbreviations	xv
Abstract	xvii
1. Introduction	1
1.1. Foreword.....	1
1.2. Defining Terms	1
Subcultures and Counter-Cultures.....	2
1.2.1. Contemporary Pagans.....	3
Unifying Characteristics in Contemporary Paganism.....	3
Branches or Traditions of Contemporary Paganism.....	4
Misconceptions Regarding Pagans.....	5
Oppression and Discrimination.....	6
Pagan Ethics.....	6
Origins of Contemporary Paganism.....	6
Pagan Community Leaders.....	7
1.2.2. Defining Heritage Professionals.....	8
Defining the Heritage Sector.....	8
Origins of Heritage Attractions.....	8
Heritage Aims and Ethics.....	9
Who Shapes Policy in the Heritage Sector?.....	9
1.2.3. Defining Archaeologists.....	10
Types of Archaeologist.....	10
Archaeological Ethics and Codes of Practice.....	11
Contesting Archaeology.....	11
1.2.4. Pagan Archaeologists and Heritage Professionals.....	11
1.3. Situating the Researcher.....	11
1.4. The Structure of the Book.....	11
2. Research Design and Implementation	13
2.1. Introduction.....	13
2.2. Planning.....	13
2.3. Choosing a Methodology.....	13
2.3.1. Aims and Objectives.....	13
2.3.2. Situation.....	13
2.3.3. Methodological Courses.....	14
2.3.4. Factors Affecting Choice of Methodology.....	14
2.3.5. The Methodological Plan.....	15
2.4. Ethical Standards and Considerations.....	15
2.4.1. Ethical Sources.....	15
2.4.2. Ethical Concerns with the Research.....	15
2.4.3. Ethical Research Implementation.....	16
2.5. Reflexivity.....	16
2.6. Research Method Selection.....	17
2.6.1. Research Method Courses.....	17
2.6.2. Research Method Factors.....	18
2.6.3. Research plan.....	19
2.6.4. Execution – Data Collection.....	19
2.6.5. Execution – Data Analysis and Interpretation.....	19
2.6.6. Execution – Dissemination of Results.....	20

2.7. Lessons from the Field	20
2.7.1. Hostility and Hospitality at Stonehenge	20
2.7.2. Complaint at Nevern	21
2.7.3. Museum Refusal	21
2.8. Trust	21
2.8.1. Challenging Ideas	21
2.9. Insiders, Outsiders and ‘Going Native’	22
2.10. Conclusions	22
3. Sites – Access	23
3.1. Introduction	23
3.1.1. Defining Access	23
3.1.2. Which Sites Have Been Contested for Access?	23
3.1.3. What Were Contested Sites in the Past?	24
3.1.4. How Did They Become Significant to Contemporary Pagans?	24
3.2. Differing Aims and Requirements	24
3.2.1. Pagan Expectations	24
3.2.2. Archaeologists’ Agendas	24
3.2.3. Policies and Agendas of Heritage Organisations	25
3.3. Case Study 1: Stonehenge and the Free Festival	25
3.3.1. Stonehenge on the Ground	25
3.3.2. Stonehenge Explanations	26
3.3.3. The Protection and Management of Stonehenge	27
3.3.4. Stonehenge as a Sacred Site	28
3.3.5. Stonehenge as a Contested Site	28
Early Contestation (Before 1970)	29
The Stonehenge Free Festival	29
How Pagan was the Festival?	30
Problems with the Festival	30
Suppression of the Festival and Exclusion at the Solstice	31
Reaction and Justification	32
The Stonehenge Exclusion Zone and its Challengers	33
Modes of contestation	34
A Solution: Managed Open Access	34
Other Issues at Stonehenge	37
Consequences of Stonehenge	37
3.4. Case Study 2: Avebury	37
3.4.1. The Significance of Avebury	38
3.4.2. Protecting and Managing Avebury	38
3.4.3. Pagan Use of the Site	38
3.4.4. Contesting the Site	39
Locals Versus Visitors	39
Pagans Versus Pagans	40
The Role of Heritage Managers in Contesting Avebury	40
3.4.5. Avebury Solutions	41
3.5. Theorising Contestation of Access	42
3.5.1. Why Demand Access	42
Spiritual Reasons	42
Political Reasons	42
3.5.2. Why Oppose Access?	42
3.5.3. Why Are Other Sites Not Contested In This Way?	43
3.5.4. Assessing the Claims	43
3.5.5. Options for the Future	43
3.6. Conclusions	44

4. Sites – Preservation and Protection	45
4.1. Introduction	45
4.1.1. Defining Protection and Preservation	45
4.1.2. State Protection and Preservation of Ancient Sites in the UK	45
4.2. Protection from Development	46
4.2.1. Case Study 1: Nine Ladies Stone Circle	46
Threats to Nine Ladies	46
Protection Campaign	46
Outcome	46
4.2.2. Case Study 2: Thornborough Henges	47
Threats to Thornborough	48
Campaign to Protect Thornborough	48
The Outcome of the Protests	49
4.2.3. Case Study 3: Crossbones Graveyard	49
Campaign to Preserve Crossbones	50
Understanding Contestation at Crossbones	50
4.2.4. Understanding Pagan Protection of Sites from Development	51
4.3. Protecting Sites from Archaeological Excavation	52
4.3.1. Case Study 4: Seahenge or Holme-next-the-Sea Timber Circle	52
Initial Analysis	52
Preservation In-Situ or Excavation and Removal?	52
Community Involvement	53
Protest	53
Detailed Analysis, Storage and Preservation	54
Display at King’s Lynn	54
The Legacy of Seahenge	56
4.3.2. Case Study 5: Nevern Castle	56
Excavation	56
Brithdir Mawr and Tir Ysprydol	56
Protest at Nevern	57
Engaging with the Protests	57
Theorising Nevern	57
4.4. Theorising Preservation and Protection	58
4.5. Options for the Future	58
5. Sites – Representation and Ownership	59
5.1. Introduction	59
5.1.1. Ownership, Stakeholdership and Representation	59
5.1.2. Defining Earth Mysteries	59
5.1.3. Earth Mysteries in Contemporary Paganism	60
5.1.4. Community	60
5.1.5. Public Archaeology and Heritage	60
Paying for heritage	61
5.1.6. Public Driven Archaeology and Heritage	61
5.1.7. Outreach in Archaeology and Heritage	61
5.2. Case Studies	62
5.2.1. Case Study 1: Glastonbury	62
Landscape and Character	62
Cultural History	62
Archaeology	62
Glastonbury Earth Mysteries	63
Christian Glastonbury	63
Pagan Glastonbury	63
Contested Glastonbury	63
Archaeologists and Earth Mysteries	64

5.2.2. Case Study 2: The Rollright Stones.....	64
Archaeology of the Rollright Stones	64
Folklore of the Rollright Stones	65
Ownership.....	65
Pagan Activity at the Rollright Stones.....	67
Vandalism at the Rollright Stones	67
5.2.3. Case Study 3: Interpreting Stonehenge.....	67
5.3. Contesting Interpretations and Ownership	69
5.4. Theorising Contestation of Ownership and Interpretation	69
5.4.1. Why demand Ownership/Stakeholdership.....	69
Spiritual Reasons.....	69
Political Reasons	70
5.4.2. Theorising Community Involvement and Stakeholdership	70
5.4.3. Suggested Solutions.....	70
5.5. Conclusions	71
6. Archaeologists, Museum professionals and Human Remains.....	73
6.1. Introduction	73
6.2. The Importance of Human Remains in Archaeology and Heritage.....	73
6.2.1. What Human Remains Reveal About the Past	74
6.2.2. Displaying Human Remains	75
6.2.3. Why Are Remains Not on Display Retained in Storage?.....	75
6.3. How Are Remains Treated?.....	75
6.3.1. Law, Ethical Guidelines and Organisation Policies.....	75
Legal Requirements.....	75
Ethical Guidelines and Professional Codes of Conduct	76
Organisational Policies on Human Remains	79
Implications of Laws, Codes and Policies.....	79
6.3.2. How Human Remains Are Treated in Practice	80
Excavating Human Remains	80
Analysis of Human Remains	81
Storage.....	82
Display.....	82
De-accessioning, Disposal and Reburial	84
6.4. Conclusion	85
7. Contemporary Pagans and Ancestors.....	87
7.1. Introduction	87
7.2. British Pagans and the Concept of Ancestors.....	87
7.2.1. Who Are the Ancestors?	87
7.2.2. Origins of Ancestor Veneration in Contemporary Paganism.....	87
7.2.3. Why Are They the Ancestors?	88
7.2.4. Implications of Pagan Ancestor ‘Worship’	88
7.3. Contestation Overseas	88
7.3.1. Australian Aboriginal Contestation.....	89
Truganini and William Lanne.....	89
Legal Changes	90
7.3.2. American Indians and NAGPRA.....	90
Kennewick Man.....	90
7.3.3. Critiques of Repatriation and Reburial Claims for Remains from Abroad.....	90
Identity Based Reasons.....	91
Spiritual Reasons	91
Political Reasons	91
7.4. Contesting Human Remains in the UK	91
7.4.1. Origins of Contestation in the UK.....	91

7.5. Case Studies.....	92
7.5.1. Case Study 1: Charlie at Avebury.....	92
7.5.2. Case Study 2: Stonehenge Human Remains.....	94
7.5.3. Case Study 3: The Red Lady of Paviland.....	97
7.5.4. Case Study 4: Lindow Man.....	100
7.6. Modes of Contestation by Pagans.....	104
7.6.1. CoBDO West.....	104
7.6.2. HAD.....	104
7.6.3. LAW, Stonehenge Druids and CoBDO.....	105
7.6.4. Dead to Rights.....	106
7.6.5. Pagans for Archaeology.....	106
7.7. Reasons and Arguments For and Against Reburial.....	106
7.7.1. Spiritual Arguments.....	106
Affecting a Dualist Afterlife.....	106
Disturbing the Monist Soul.....	107
Sacred Sites and the Dead.....	107
Pagan Values and Aspirations.....	107
Spiritual Authority.....	108
7.7.2. Identity Based Reasons.....	109
7.7.3. Ethical.....	110
Equality with Other Religions.....	111
Respect and Honour, Dignity and Decency.....	113
Ownership.....	115
Exclusive and Inclusive Rights.....	115
7.8. Non-Reburial Challenges.....	116
7.8.1. Objectification Versus Personhood.....	116
7.8.2. Case Studies.....	116
Case Study 1: Dublin Museum.....	116
Case Study 2: Bristol Museum.....	117
7.8.3. Access to remains for ritual.....	117
7.8.4. Respectful Storage.....	117
7.9. Conclusions.....	117
8. Understanding and Addressing Contestation.....	119
8.1. Introduction.....	119
8.2. Explaining Contestation.....	119
8.2.1. Pagan Assumptions, Attitudes and Agendas.....	120
Underlying Motivations for Pagan Contestation of Remains.....	120
Archaeological Complicity in Suppression.....	120
Asserting Equal Rights.....	121
Anti-Intellectualism and Conflicting Worldviews.....	121
Control of Identity.....	121
A Pagan Absolutism?.....	121
8.2.2. Archaeological and Heritage Assumptions, Attitudes and Agendas.....	122
Underlying Attitudes of Archaeologists and Heritage Professionals.....	122
Low Value Attribution to Contemporary Paganism.....	122
Archaeological and Heritage Agendas.....	123
8.2.3. Common Ground.....	123
Preservation and Stewardship.....	123
Increasing Understanding and Valuing the Past.....	123
8.2.4. Consequences of Assumptions, Attitudes and Agendas.....	123
Complicating Factors.....	123
Different Epistemologies.....	123
Divergent Aims, Divergent Priorities.....	124

8.3. Addressing Contestation	124
8.3.1. Ignoring Campaigners	124
8.3.2. Challenging Assumptions and Respecting Identity	124
8.3.3. Addressing Contestation of Sites	125
Stakeholdership	125
Polyvocality in Archaeological interpretations	125
8.3.4. Addressing Contestation of Human Remains	125
What Archaeologists and Museum Professionals Can Do	125
What Pagans Can Do	126
8.3.5. Finding a Balance	126
8.3.6. Negotiation, Truth and Reconciliation	126
8.3.7. Opposition to Contestation Within the Pagan Community	127
Divergent Druidries	127
Addressing Religious Extremism	128
8.3.8. Continuous Negotiation	128
8.4. Conclusions	128
8.5. Final Words	129
Bibliography	131
Personal Communications	151